Minutes of the March 11, 2021 Meeting

The Regular meeting of the Marin Operational Area Disaster and Citizen Corps Council (DC3) was held digitally on Thursday, March 11, 2021, in compliance of local and state shelter in place orders as allowed by Governor Newsom’s Executive Order N-29-20. DC3 will not be providing in person meetings until further notice. The Council and Public have been given instructions on how to join and participate in these meetings.


1. CALL TO ORDER

Marin County Supervisor Dennis Rodoni ("Chair") called the meeting to order at 3:06 p.m. The meeting was held virtually.

APPROVAL OF December 10, 2020 MINUTES

The Chair asked for a Motion to Approve the December 10, 2020 minutes after a quorum was met. As submitted to the Council, with no corrections and no additions, the Minutes were adopted.

Motion: Lion / Second: Schulze
AYES: ALL

2. CHANGES TO AGENDA: None.

3. Presentations:

COVID-19 Update, by Dr. Matt Willis

Dr. Willis wanted to share an update on where the County was with the COVID-19 response and would focus on the vaccine distribution plan. He also reminded everyone that we are at the one-year anniversary of the County’s first COVID-19 case. He shared the story of Lucio Gonzalez, a passenger of the Diamond Princess Cruise ship. The County team got close to him because he was their first case. The anniversary is coming up next week and his family was kind enough to allow us to share a picture of him and his story as a reminder that the numbers Dr. Willis shares, reflect people – fathers, mothers, grandparents.

The mortality trends have improved in Marin County largely due to two trends that are contributing to our improvement in terms of mortality. One is a natural decrease in the number of cases probably attributed to everyone’s behavior of physical distancing and covering their faces. There may be some seasonal component to it as well in terms of the dramatic decrease in case counts. However, this is not totally clear globally, the role of seasonality. The other factor is the contribution of vaccinations.
In January, we had thirty-nine deaths and in February we had six. In January, we were going through a cycle of second doses in our long-term care facilities. After a very aggressive effort to vaccinate long-term care facilities, skilled nursing facilities, and residential care facilities for the elderly with mobile teams, and knowing the vaccine is 95% effective in trials is one thing. But actually seeing how those manifests in terms of dramatic reductions in cases and deaths in Marin, is another. This is clear evidence. We have had no outbreaks in any of our long-term care facilities since the beginning of February.

The pace of our progress has slowed a little bit and we had dramatic reductions starting in mid-January. We are continuing to see decreases in cases and we’ll be headed toward the orange tier very likely, on March 23rd. Our case rates now correspond to orange tier numbers. We need two weeks at that rate. Unless there’s an increase in the next few days, we should be headed to the orange tier on March 23rd. We are currently in the red tier, and we were among the first counties to move from purple into red. We’ll also be among the first to move from red into orange. The criteria to meet is with case rates and percent of positive tests. They are adding another indicator that has to do with vaccination rates.

The percent of people in your lowest income communities at the county level is now going to be a criterion for an accelerated advancement into the next tier. They are using the ability to reopen as a carrot to incentivize us to do more, especially in equity, and when they do that, we tend to do well because our strategies do focus on our lower-income communities. We have relatively high vaccination rates in our lowest quartile in terms of income. When that gets added, we might move from orange to yellow in an accelerated fashion, potentially even by mid-April.

One concern right now are the COVID-19 variants. The mutations of the virus are a concern. The L452R mutation or, the California strain, are being seen more and more. It doesn’t seem to have a big difference in terms of how sick it makes people with both the risk for hospitalization and the risk of death. The vaccines we have on the market do seem to actually perform really well against this particular variant. This is the most relevant variant to us in Marin. There have been seven total samples in Marin County with this particular variant of about 100 that have been tested. It will be about a month or two before we get the results back. This is really an underestimate of the prevalence of the variants in the County. The take home message here is that the variants are part of our environment now and the California variant is anywhere between thirty to fifty percent of the strains that are currently circulating in Marin. It doesn’t impact our strategies very much and doesn’t seem to be impacting our case rates. They continue to decline and we’re not seeing increases in hospitalizations. The vaccine is really effective against them. This is another reason to double down on all the measures that we knew we needed to protect ourselves.

We still are continuing to restrict travel or recommend against travel because there are variants out there that are less benign than the California one. The South Africa variant and others have more concerning features in terms of their behavior. Whether or not they may be less responsive to the vaccine, they may be more virulent and likely to cause more severe illness and death. Those are the variants we are very interested in not importing into Marin County. The way of importation of variants occurs by people traveling outside of the area and bringing it back and allowing it to spread.

We are in a vulnerable period where we do not want people traveling, especially internationally, until we have a much wider vaccination coverage in our County. We are making progress there.

We are probably up to about twenty-nine percent of all residents in Marin today that have been vaccinated. This is almost one in three adults in Marin that have been vaccinated with at least one dose. Our vaccination rates are among the highest in the state and the highest of any county our size. There are nearly ninety percent coverage of both residents and staff in our long-term care facilities which is why you see a dramatic reduction of cases in those facilities. It has been a perfect inverse relationship between the number of people vaccinated and the number of people getting sick.

About eighty percent of our residents typically above age seventy-five have been vaccinated. We are making sure that we’re paying attention to the particular vulnerability of some groups in our county. Our vaccine strategy has tried to make sure that we’re removing any barriers for access in our LatinX
community and essential workers. It was validated by data that shows that we’ve vaccinated probably eighty percent of our residents above sixty-five in our LatinX community, an even higher proportion than those that are white, non-Hispanic community.

Marin County Office of Education (MCOE) has been a valuable partner since the beginning, even before COVID. Schools are really an arm of public health. They are so much more than hubs of learning, but of health and well-being for our children and our families in our communities.

It was natural for us to work well together when COVID-19 began, and the evidence shows. We have some of the lowest case rates of any schools in the state and some of the highest number of children coming into schools on an everyday basis.

About ninety-six percent of our schools are open to some form of classroom-based learning with only eleven cases of suspected in-school transmission since September when we began reopening schools. One of the strategies was vaccinating our teachers. By this Saturday, we’ll have vaccinated everyone of our educators who has sought vaccination. Last Saturday, we had the biggest single vaccination event in Marin County since 1962 on “K.O. Polio Day” with 2,000 vaccinations. There were over 2,000 vaccinations over and eight-hour period at the Marin Center for our educators and teachers. We will have another one lined up this coming Saturday, where we’ll be bumping it up to 2,500. This comes to about four vaccines per minute. We have four of these “Super Saturdays” scheduled and we’ll have all our teachers fully immunized by April 10.

One hundred percent of our elementary, K through eight schools, eight out of nine middle schools, and twelve out of seventeen high schools are open. Mike Grant, MCOE representative, noted that by next week, one hundred percent of high schools would be open.

Dr. Willis said that next week we’re moving into opening a new tier. Phase 1A was the health care workers and first responders. Phase 1B included these occupations, anyone above age sixty-five, our agricultural workers, food workers, and our school and emergency workers.

Now we are moving onto anyone age sixteen to sixty-four with chronic medical conditions. We are working with our medical providers to reach out to people who have chronic medical conditions. Almost all these people are followed by a physician who knows their medical condition and we can reach them through this network. We are opening up visits to our medical providers to be able to get their patients in to our vaccination sites. Once we’ve moved through this referral-based process, we will open it more widely to the public to be able to register for appointments if they have a medical condition through a self-attestation process. Someone would have to verify they actually do have one of these conditions. Then they would be able to schedule an appointment for a vaccine.

We do have appointments available at our pharmacies. There are seventeen pharmacies across the County that are offering vaccines, much like they offer flu shots. The best place to find out what your vaccination options are would be to go www.getvaccinatedmarin.org which is continually updated with vaccine clinics, pharmacy or otherwise, that are coming on-line.

If anyone you know needs help scheduling an appointment who is eligible, we have a phone number you can call for assistance with this.

Questions:

Ed Schulze, District 5 Representative, asked if there was an outreach for our farm workers who might not have access to the Internet or have a language barrier.

Dr. Willis responded that there was a group established for those in our farm agricultural community, mostly in West Marin. We have mobile teams that go out there to vaccinate agricultural workers. We have also allocated doses to Coastal Health Alliance and to Dr. Hamblin who is a West Marin physician, who is also bringing people in from the community.
Adriana Rabkin, VOAD Representative, asked if they were able to keep track of the people in Marin who are getting vaccinated in different counties.

Dr. Willis said the numbers he has shared are not perfectly aligned with the ones we track in Marin. The state database is organized by where you live. We end up vaccinating people who work in Marin but live outside, and people who can get vaccinated outside of Marin because they may work there or find appointments there and get registered. The numbers shared are Marin County residents who have been vaccinated regardless of where they were vaccinated.

Adriana asked if this includes FEMA as well. Dr. Willis said it does all go into the state database. She also asked in terms of the unvaccinated numbers, if there is a sense of what percentage of those who do not want the vaccine. Dr. Willis replied they do have a sense or an estimate. The question is, what’s one hundred percent? What is your target? Is it eighty percent? We’re encouraged to see that we’ve gone above eighty percent of residents aged seventy-five and older, and that is not unexpected.

We know that vaccine hesitancy is much lower in older residents, likely because these people have lived through disease experiences younger people have not. Polio was active, so the value of vaccination as a safe and effective way of prevention is clearer to our older residents.

There’s another group, the anti-vax, which is a very small group. It’s almost no one who is against vaccination; it’s a bad term and we don’t use it. Vaccine hesitancy are those who are not sure about the vaccine and may just need more time. There is also the vaccine deliberate who want to watch and see what happens. They plan on getting the vaccine but want to see what happens as it rolls out over the population over time. We are working to address anyone’s fears and concerns to move forward.

Adriana asked of the remaining people left to be vaccinated, how does the County plan on reaching those who still need to be vaccinated as tiers open. Dr. Willis replied that they have estimated that we should be able to get Marin County adults vaccinated by June. This is more accelerated than we had expected. Unless there is an interruption in the supply, we should be able to get everyone before June among adults.

Children will not be eligible to be vaccinated at that point anyways since studies will not be complete. It may be summer to fall for children. This gives us time to reach everyone who is not vaccinated either due to hesitancy or deliberateness or they could have access and functional needs that have prevented them for getting vaccinated. We are working with these parallels. We need to continue to focus on speed of getting through the majority of our population and reserving resources to make sure we are reaching out to those who have challenges. Driving to homes to vaccinate people is part of our plan further down the road.

Peter Mendoza, AFN Representative, gave his appreciation to everyone working in support of our communities on this health issue. He wanted everyone to know that Marin Center for Independent Living (MCIL) received a notification that the California Foundation of Independent Living Centers has been working on getting vaccine access to older people and those with disabilities. There will be guidance issued clarifying that people who are served by independent living centers, like MCIL, the regional center, Golden Gate Regional Center, and those who receive in-home services, will not be accidentally turned away when they should not have been.

Marin CIL heard of at least one site where there weren’t restrooms for a few days when the vaccination site was opened and wanted to know if that had been resolved.

Dr. Willis said that he and his office will keep an eye out for the guidance. He was confident that it was consistent with the way his team has been working already.

He also said that the Curative site at the Ferry Terminal is either in the process or already have non-permanent bathrooms in place. This is in addition to the bathrooms that already exist at the Ferry site.
These Minutes were reviewed and approved at the June 10, 2021 Marin Disaster Council Meeting.

They realized they were too far from where people were lining up in their vehicles. These porta-potties have been installed partially based on advocacy for Peter and his group.

Woody Baker-Cohn added that these porta-potties were installed yesterday, though they should have been added sooner.

**Garry Lion, Marin Economic Forum Representative,** said that he’d noticed that the CDC is starting to issue guidelines for people that are vaccinated and how they can intermix with their family. He has three grandchildren, who cannot be vaccinated yet. Their parents are vaccinated, and he wanted to know how closely they could intermix at this point.

Dr. Willis said that as long as he is vaccinated, the CDC is recommending that you can gather with them, even with some being vaccinated and some not. The state has not followed the CDC yet with this guidance. CDPH will offer local recommendations on following the CDC guidance soon.

**Mike Grant, MCOE Representative,** wanted to express his appreciation for Dr. Willis and Dr. Santora. He spoke of the fortunate partnership they have where public-private-independent schools are working closely with the public health team, OES, and fire in order to meet the needs of the students, staff, and community. Next week, one hundred percent of Marin schools will be open.

Looking back at the December minutes, the case rate was ramping up again, and he wanted to thank Dr. Willis and everyone for their ongoing support and partnership.

Dr. Willis said he stopped by MCOE yesterday and said it was very well stocked with supplies, including PPE, for the students.

**Catherine Way, Marin Council of Mayors & Councilmembers Representative,** wanted to add her appreciation on how well Dr. Willis and his staff have been communicating to the cities and towns, through their town managers. She also noted how well they and OES and how nimble they’ve had to be during this with how often rules and guidelines change.

4. **NEW BUSINESS:**

**Supervisor Rodoni** wanted to make an announcement in regard to the DC3 members. He noted departed members, Chris Choo (DPW) and Vincent Valenzuela (Red Cross) have left DC3. He wanted to welcome new members, Carey Lando (DPW), Ann Eichhorn (Red Cross), and Chris Le Baudour (EMS.) He noted that the **At-Large** position is open and was being advertised. The **Police Chiefs Association** and **Special Districts** are working on an appointment for their open positions as well.

**Tsunami Preparedness Week & Resolution, by Tom Jordan**

We had a planning workshop held today that included County Fire, Sheriff’s Office patrol, local public and private organizations, and a neighborhood disaster response team at Stinson Beach. Our objectives were to look at the promulgation of warning and how to facilitate evacuation. Obviously alert and warning is difficult in the coastal communities in Marin the way telco infrastructure works there. There are some evacuation concerns in communities like Stinson Beach, which have a large number of recreational visitors in the area. This gives a potential for traffic congestion but also represents a population that might not be familiar with the hazards or escape routes.
There’s a playbook series that’s been developed for all coastal communities in California and we look for any new best practices that we would want to incorporate with that. We are trying to build cooperation and build consensus among our response partners from training and exercises. Due to COVID-19, our workshop was virtual, and replaced the in-person drill that we usually do.

There will be a Resolution recognizing March 22 through 26 as “Tsunami Preparedness Week” in Marin County. The Resolution will go to the Board of Supervisors for approval on the 16th and will be championed by our director of Emergency Services, Supervisor Rodoni.

As some people know, we do this annually. If you haven’t yet, please look at the Tsunami Zone. It is an online resource akin to the “Great Shakeout” that has a lot of educational materials for reference and if you wanted to hold your own kind of drill. There is a lot of marketing information available if your organization wanted to promote tsunami preparedness. It helps the facilitators of the Tsunami Zone if you register your organization, self, or family – though this is not necessarily just for people who reside on the coast, but for anyone who might work there or recreate on the coast.

Questions:

Adriana Rabkin, VOAD Representative, asked how he would publicize this. Is there information going out to the public?

Tom responded that the information will be pushed through our local media channels on the coast, Point Reyes Light and KWMR. The Sheriff’s Office Social Media Team will also have outreach where they will encourage partners with social media platforms in the County to echo this in order to reach as many people as possible. The Marin Independent Journal is also aware of the workshop we had and the Resolution going forward.

Animal Services Annex to the EOP, by Tom Jordan

There is a target completion date for the end of this month at which point, the annex will go to the Board of Supervisors for adoption. This plan addresses evacuation and shelter-in-place response involving service animals, companion animals, livestock and horses. Horses by law, are considered livestock. However, that definition is based on use and an “old draft horse pulling a wagon” kind of use case. In Marin County, many of our equestrian community utilize horses for other purposes and that presents a different set of circumstances around evacuation, shelter-in-place decisions and resources. Thus, horses and livestock were separated.

We have a well-developed planning committee and very engaged committee representing the Office of Emergency Services, our Department of Agricultural Weights and Measures, University Co-op Extension out of U.C. Davis, and Marin Humane.

Our planning committee is a bit more broad and includes doctors of veterinary medicine and adjacent counties that we might participate response with, as well as others deemed appropriate by the planning committee.

Questions:

Catherine Way, Marin Council of Mayors & Councilmembers Representative, asked if the committee was taking into account the issue we faced several years ago when people evacuating from Sonoma and Napa Counties brought their pets with them when they fled to the Civic Center shelter.
These Minutes were reviewed and approved at the June 10, 2021 Marin Disaster Council Meeting.

Tom said that yes, sheltering individuals with service/companion animals is part of the plan. This includes looking at a fire scenario specifically. All of our planning committee have suggested when looking for places, especially in the scenario of a large fire in Sonoma County, Marin County has the same fuel topography climate generally, so they are looking at large animal evacuation to occur outside of the region. There is so much involved in moving large animals, so they are looking outside the region.

**Ed Schulze, District 5 Representative**, asked if the Humane Society had enough crates to keep animals separate.

Tom said they do, and they also have a cache of animal disaster supplies to include in enclosures. Cindy Machado has developed an extremely strong partner network Humane organizations so that we could leverage those resources. One of the advantages of this is that we know all this equipment and food are in good condition.

5. **OLD BUSINESS:**

**Status of Grants Administered by Marin County OES**

*Please email OES at oes@marinsheriff.org for a copy of the grants report, which was shared at this meeting by Therese Gorostiza, OES Grants Manager.*

6. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**Public Disaster Education & Preparedness Committee Report**

Catherine Way, Marin Council of Mayors & Councilmembers, spoke about their past two meetings in December and January. They had a strategic planning discussion on potential presentation topics and speakers to be brought to the DC3 for review. They wanted to narrow the focus for the DC3 and have already shared this with Supervisor Rodoni.

The following is an overview of the discussion:

- Focus on Marin’s most vulnerable residents
  - Who are Marin’s most vulnerable?
  - What is the disaster?
- Neighborhood organizations and outreach
  - County disaster coordinator
  - Regional NRG coordinators
- Communication programs and tools, i.e. *Ready Marin*
  - How different groups are encouraging regional collaboration
  - All-hazards approach to look at the messaging across all the sources
- Equity among all three of these points

During the next month, they will focus on Marin’s most vulnerable residents and will be evaluating who they serve and in what capacity. They also want to see who is being missed and how they can be reached.

Questions:

**Peter Mendoza, AFN Representative** said that the MCIL would like to include seniors and people with disabilities with this. He said that some needs may be different, but they do share a lot of the same needs for services and support, even when they are living independently. This is something that is
recognized through the Commission on Aging, The Aging Action Initiative, and even on the state level for the California Department of Aging. They are trying to involve people with disabilities and older adults so that no one is left out in the process.

Catherine responded that these groups are on the list of what they would like to focus on. Adriana added that they are really focused on equity for all, that includes vulnerable residents. She also mentioned non-English speakers who may not be getting information in the same way and those who are digitally illiterate or do not have access to online resources. They really want to make sure no one is falling through the cracks.

Pati Stoliar, Age Friendly Corte Madera, wanted to thank Adriana and Catherine for the presentation. This is what she and her organization has been talking about in all their neighbor-to-neighbor, NRG, and VOAD meetings. She was thrilled to see that this is what the aim would be for 2021.

Catherine noted that Pati is very involved in the age-friendly community, Central Marin Fire and NRG committees. There are a lot of good people here that all need to coordinate together and learn from each other. This is something PDEP has realized in the last several years.

For more information about this committee's activities and copies of the handouts, please email OES at oes@marinsheriff.org.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS/COUNCIL MEMBER ITEMS/ PUBLIC COMMENTS

Adriana Rabkin, VOAD Representative, wanted to talk about what they are focusing on this year. They have divided the year into quarters to reflect on the following topics:

- **January – March:** Planning and helping CBOs collaborate with one another in similar focus areas; case management services.
- **April – June:** Response; they will work with CBOs in their actual disaster response.
- **July – September:** Exercises and tabletop activities
- **October – December:** Recovery and what that means in a post-disaster situation.

She also mentioned, if COVID allows, they plan on having a conference this year as well.

Supervisor Rodoni thanked both Catherine and Adriana for their reports. He appreciated that they have a focused plan.

Stephen Marcotte, District 4 Representative, wanted to mention that CERT is back. They will be opening an online CERT class later this month. In May, they will hold a one-day in-person class.

Peter Mendoza, AFN Representative wanted to thank the County employees working on the COVID response. MCIL serves on the access and functional needs task force. Their role is to help the County address the needs of people with disabilities and older adults. Everyone works collaboratively to make sure the process is accessible and equitable for the communities they serve.

He also wanted to praise the work of the task force, which is led by Laney Davidson and Suzanne Levine, who are the County’s ADA coordinators. He also thanked Lisa Santora and Public Health, and the County PIO, Laine Hendricks
Ed Schulze, District 5 Representative mentioned that towers were being erected on Bolinas Ridge and Cypress Point on Tomales Bay by the Audubon Canyon Ranch in order to monitor tagged species. He was not sure if this could be used in a joint venture, possibly for radio blind spots or tsunami warnings.

Supervisor Rodoni reported on Chief Jason Weber's behalf that he and the Fire Chiefs are continuing on refining the job description for the community disaster coordinator position. They have agreed to work with Catherin and Adriana on some of the final details of appointing the person who fills this position.

He also wanted to report that he has met with the County Administrators Office, Matthew Hymel, Sheriff Doyle, Chief Weber, and Chris Reilly about doing a high-level review and assessment of OES. This would include some work with DC3. It is likely we will budget and hire a consultant to work with our OES team to move this forward in the next budget year. He was really excited to do this and really start to prepare the County for the next decade of what is in tail for emergency preparedness and how we need to respond to things.

He is looking forward to this in the new year with the combined effort with the sheriff, the CAO's office, and fire. These three major agencies really get involved in emergency work and emergency preparedness. We will probably start to see some results of this early next year.

8. ADJOURN:

   Being no further business, the Chair asked for a Motion to Adjourn the Meeting at 4:45.
   Motion: All in favor.

9. CERTIFICATE

   I hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct copy of the minutes of the Marin Operational Area Disaster and Citizen Corps Council meeting, held on December 10, 2020.

__________________________________________

Date

__________________________________________

Therese Gorostiza, Office of Emergency Services