



**Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of
the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3)
Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019**

**PDE+P Meeting Minutes for May 6, 2019
Approved at PDEP meeting of 6/3/219**

Members Present:

Catherine Way	CoChair, DC3 City of Larkspur Councilmember, MCCMC
Frank Cox	CoChair, DC3 Member, OES Auxiliary, OES trainer
Garry Lion	DC3 member, Marin Economic Forum
Peter Mendoza	DC3 / AFN representative
Tom Cromwell	Marin Medical Reserve Corps, etc.

Alternant member attending for Vincent Valenzuela / ARC:

Lois Roth	Red Cross, lois.roth@redcross.org
-----------	---

Members Excused or Absent:

Keith Kennedy	DC3 Member, Dist. 3 / Sausalito area
James Wickham	PG&E Safety + Preparedness Specialist, MV City Council
Maggie Lang	CERT Coordinator, Get Ready / Southern Marin
Megan Stevenson	Sr Program Coordinator H&HS Public Health Preparedness
Quinn Gardner	SRFD emergency manager
Vincent Valenzuela	San Rafael Red Cross Disaster Manager (see Alternant above)

Members Public Present

Adriana Rabkin	CVNL rep to MIDC marinvoad@gmail.com
Anna Lane	Red Cross, Community Partnership anna.lane@redcross.org
Ann Eichhorn	Red Cross Chair, Marin County
Cindy Swift	CERT, Fairfax cindyswift@sbcglobal.net
Jay Hubert	RACES j-mhubert@att.net
Lori Schifrin	MMRC, CERT, etc. / lori.sch@att.net

Handouts distributed:

- Agenda, PDEP meeting 05/06/2019
- Draft PDEP Minutes 2019-03-04 (b).pdf
- 5 Best + Worst places Live / Quake <http://temblor.net/earthquake-insights/>:
- Grand Jury Report: Wildfire Preparedness, a New Approach
- Passed around - Flyer NRG Event 5-16-19 Insuring vs Disasters

I. Welcome, Introductions, Handouts. Review of Minutes

- Catherine welcomed attendees, and introductions were made.
- On review of the January minutes, Maggie and Frank both made minor suggestions. Draft minutes approved with adopted suggestions.

II. The Quake on our horizon - Bay Area Regional impact. Preparedness Gaps

- Volkan Sevilgen, Co-Founder of the Earthquake website and app: www.Temblor.Net was scheduled to speak, but was called to a London appointment at the last minute, and was unable to attend. We look forward to hearing from him at a future time.

III. Grand Jury Report: Wildfire Preparedness: A New Approach

- PDEP and others present reviewed and discussed the new Grand Jury report - online: <https://www.marincounty.org/depts/gj/reports-and-responses>
- The core finding, that Marin faces unprecedented danger to life and property from wildfire, and that 'We are living in a powder keg' is well supported by recent history. PDEP agrees a robust and coordinated effort to prepare for wildfires, at every level, is a high priority for all of us living or working in Marin County.



Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3) Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019

- The Grand Jury (GJ) report was released 4/25/2019. Public agencies have a reply due date of July 18, 2019, so all of our comments remain preliminary, identifying some areas of the report that will require further discussion, including:
 - The GJ reported that Alert Marin is an 'Opt In' system that has registered about 10% of the population. However, OES Manager Chris Reilly explained at the Wildfire Forum held at Embassy Suites on 5/4/19 that Alert Marin includes not only voluntary 'Opt In' registrants, but has incorporated 'land line' (POTs or VOIP) numbers from Comcast, Verizon, AT&T, White Pages, and other groups to reach about 95% of the population. Cellphone and email registration, to date, does require 'Opt In' action by citizens.
 - As the GJ reports, a large area extended power outage, such as planned by Public Safety Power Outages by PG&E during Red Flag high risk fire days¹, could cripple alert systems at every level.
 - Without reliable electrical power - cell signals and towers, cellphones and tablets, VOIP phones, wall powered TV and Radio, most computers, Wireless Emergency Alerts (WEA) and Emergency Alert System (EAS) alerts², and more are likely to fail for most persons.
 - Many these existing alert systems can only approximate coverage in any geographical area, and can be too broad or too narrow in reaching intended audiences. Further, people who use cellphones are mobile - and may receive localized alerts when far from any danger. Such issues present technical challenges that could benefit from additional study.
 - While smartphones and tablets are common in Marin, there remain a large number of persons who either do not use, or do not carry with them, such technology. Planning emergency alerts must include a wide range of tools to reach the greatest number of persons at risk. Legislation expanding 'Opt Out' types of alert systems is needed.
 - Persons with Access and Functional Needs (AFN)³ are historically the most at risk in case of a major fire, quake, or similar disaster. Emergency Alerts, Preparedness, Evacuation, Response, and Recovery for such persons will require expanded effort.
 - The GJ recommendation that a Joint Powers Authority (JPA) be created to coordinate fire preparedness with a focus on pre-ignition and pre-suppression

¹ PG&E Public Safety Power Outages - see: https://www.pge.com/en_US/safety/emergency-preparedness/natural-disaster/wildfires/public-safety-power-shutoff-faq.page

² Wireless Emergency Alerts (WEA) and Emergency Alert System (EAS) <https://www.ready.gov/alerts> and <https://www.fema.gov/frequently-asked-questions-wireless-emergency-alerts>

³ Persons who have Access and functional needs (AFN) refers to individuals who are or have:

- Physical, developmental or intellectual disabilities
- Chronic conditions or injuries
- Limited English proficiency
- Older adults
- Children
- Low income, homeless and/or transportation disadvantaged (i.e., dependent on public transit)
- Pregnant women (partial list)

See Cal OES resources for persons with Access & Functional Needs: <https://www.caloes.ca.gov/cal-oes-divisions/access-functional-needs>



Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3) Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019

issues only is a creative idea, but raises a great many practical and political issues.

- Frank suggested the wildfire issue is now a critical Statewide issue, or at least a very broad regional and Countywide issue. An integrated plan could start by mandating Statewide standards, such as was (partially) done when the Standardized Emergency Management (SEMS) laws were created, or various mutual aid agreements were made Statewide.⁴ Funding for these backbone services is often a mix of federal, State, and local resources.
- If the California state government mandates local government to provide a 'new program' or a 'higher level of service' the State Constitution requires the state to provide reimbursement to the local authorities. The key to a Statewide program, therefore, is to mandate the program to Counties, Cities, and Special Districts.⁵
- Accordingly, the GJ recommendation of a Joint Power Agreement (JPA) funded by local parcel and sales tax to create a new 'umbrella organization' may not acknowledge the Statewide problem requires a Statewide solution, and funding.
- The GJ comment that Marin Transit is the is the only transportation agency with a seat in the EOC, and that Golden Gate Transit emergency managers, SMART representatives, Whistlestop, Marin Airporter and ferry operators are excluded, simplifies a complex EOC process.
- Further, the suggestion that having more transportation agencies sitting in the EOC would substantially improve evacuation services for persons with AFN is also an oversimplification. Persons with AFN include those institutionally supported (hospitals, Skilled Nursing Facilities, assisted living, supported by in-home services, NOT supported by in home services or other public programs, and a wide of particularized circumstances). Evacuation planning is a far more complex issue than simply increasing public transit units.
- For example - evacuating persons dependent on durable medical equipment (DME) such as motorized wheelchairs, oxygen units, TTY units, WiFi enabled communication devices etc.by ambulance often requires the person to be separated from critically needed equipment.
- Bringing services and staff to the person with AFN who can shelter in place, or evacuating them to a temporary zone of safety, may in some disasters (not all) be preferable than mass-transiting them to another city or out of county. How to do that, by whom, and for what types of AFN populations is very complex.

⁴ Standardized Emergency Management System (SEMS): <https://www.caloes.ca.gov/cal-oes-divisions/planning-preparedness/standardized-emergency-management-system> and Mutual Aid: <https://www.caloes.ca.gov/PlanningPreparednessSite/Documents/CAMasterMutAidAgreement.pdf>

⁵ California Constitution Articles XIII A and XIII B provides, in part
'(a) Whenever the Legislature or any state agency mandates a new program or higher level of service on any local government, the State shall provide a subvention of funds to reimburse that local government for the costs of the program or increased level of service, except that the Legislature may, but need not, provide a subvention of funds for the following mandates: (a long list of exceptions follows)'

See the Legislative Office PPTX on Mandated Programs:

https://lao.ca.gov/2007/whats_a_mandate/Acro/What_Is_a_Mandate.pdf

See the Cal OES 'Yellow Book' carefully legislating some programs with funding, some without State funding: <https://www.caloes.ca.gov/LegalAffairsSite/Documents/Cal%20OES%20Yellow%20Book.pdf>



Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3) Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019

- Even locating persons with AFN, who may be mobile at the time of a disaster, whether by public, private, or voluntary listing and communications channels present a wide range of variables.
- Being on a 'public AFN list' may be a death knell for some persons. Once they are 'listed' they may feel someone will find them and support them during a disaster. However, finding, staffing, and resourcing people with AFN on a public list during a disaster present almost impossible practical problems.
- Some providers, such as those offered to Kaiser patients, do offer home care services that may be unavailable to persons not part of their organizations.
- A partial, if incomplete, solution to these complex issues may be to provide public funded support for the many civilian disaster related efforts, such as CERT, Neighborhood Response Groups, faith based groups, Firewise USA™ communities, ARC, and a wide range of Voluntary Organizations Active In Disaster (VOADs) such as MIDC. These citizen efforts are often more in touch with persons with AFN limitations than their public agency counterparts.
- Peter Mendoza, who is the Chairperson Disability Action Coalition, Vice Chairperson California State Independent Living Council, Consumer Representative California Olmstead Advisory Committee, and an Access and Functional Needs Representative for the Marin EOC, reported that his organizations have advocated that the California Public Utilities Commission⁶ and other State offices address some of the identified issues that particularly affect persons with AFN.
- Some of the issues Peter mentioned included cooling centers for at risk persons, generators for critical equipment, communications equipment, and contingent support for events such as Public Safety Power Outages.
- Adriana noted that PDEP member Meg Stevenson commented there is no (or very limited) emergency funding to meet these AFN needs without a declared emergency or disaster. Hence, creating a resilient safety net prior to declared disasters adequate to meet many critical needs of many persons with AFN is not publicly funded.
- Finally, PDEP believes the Grand Jury Fire report raises critical issues that will require careful study and analysis. PDEP recommends that the issue be made a part of a DC3 agenda, perhaps after the agency reports are on file, and that members of DC3 be encouraged to question and comment on the GJ recommendations.

IV. Updates from PDEP members

- MCCMC Marin County Council Mayors + City Councilmembers

- Catherine reported the 'Marin Ready Together' working committee⁷ has received and spoken with key officials who prepared the 'Fire Siege - Lessons Learned Report updated March 18, 2019'⁸ A third committee, the MCCMC Disaster Preparedness Ad Hoc

⁶ California Public Utilities Commission <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/>

⁷ *Marin Ready Together* is a committee of elected officials working with Supervisor Rice in response to the Fire Siege Lessons Learned reports. See draft MCCMC minutes, Page 9 of 11, of March 3rd: <http://mccmc.org/wp-content/uploads/Minutes-3-27-19.pdf>

⁸ *Fire Siege Lessons Learned*. This working group has leaders from Fire Agencies & chiefs, MCSO and Police Chiefs Association, Land Management agencies, the Board of Supervisors, City Managers Association, and the County Administrator's Office. See their March Update: http://marin.granicus.com/DocumentViewer.php?file=marin_0ba1dc6df607f7f47cc3a889743ae128.pdf



Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3) Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019

Committee⁹, has some of the same persons attending. All of these groups are collaborating to support consistent fire codes across the County, improved vegetation and fire break mapping and enforcement, improved community outreach and alerts, more preparedness efforts, and fuel reduction.

- The Fire Chiefs hope to complete the fire code updates by October 2019.
- FireSafe Marin was awarded a \$1 Million CalFire Grant to support these efforts.
- Catherine recommended all attend the May 4 Wildfire Forum scheduled at the Embassy Suites wherein local first responder agencies and a survivor of the Paradise Fire will speak.

- West Marin

- PDEP is continuing email exchanges with Steve Marcotte, Assistant Fire Chief at Bolinas Fire Protection District, the newly appointed WMDC Coordinator, and will report on WMDC events at our next meeting.

- Red Cross

- PDEP welcomed Anna Lane, the Red Cross Community Partnership Coordinator, who appeared as the Alternate for PDEP member Vincent Valenzuela today.
- Marin Red Cross has recently staffed informational tables at events including the 4/27/19 Mill Valley Volunteer day, and will participate in the Marin Schools Emergency Council meeting later this week, and a 6/29th Ross Valley Fire event scheduled in Fairfax.
- Red Cross volunteers continue to install free fire alarms - part of the ARC Sound the Alarm program¹⁰ - in local communities.
- PDEP also welcomed Red Cross personnel attending today: Anne Eichhorn and Lois Roth, (Red Cross health services and recovery), in addition to regular PDEP attendees many of whom also volunteer for Red Cross.
- Thanks are extended to Lori Schiffrin, a regular at PDEP meetings, helped staff recent Red Cross informational table in Mill Valley.
- Red Cross has offered shelter training to Marin H&HS staff. Frank suggested that Red Cross might speak with County H.R. staff, including Anne Starr, about offering training as part of the emerging County Disaster Service Worker (DSW) training to all County employees.
- Adriana Rabkin updated us on the Marin Interagency Disaster Council (MIDC) efforts as follows:
 - MIDC, as part of a larger effort to update itself, is considering renaming itself as the Marin VOAD, to be consistent with other Voluntary Organizations Active In Disasters in identity and function.
 - Adriana and others are discussing scheduling a conference for participating organizations tentatively set 9/17/19, perhaps to address questions such as the different shelter types and functions needed by individual communities in the event of disasters.
 - Shelter management is complex. Overall, MIDC hopes to support County EOC linked shelters, with appropriate resourcing and public visibility, rather than less reliable 'pop up shelters' that can deflect coordinated efforts.

- Southern Marin / Business Community

- Garry reported the City of Mill Valley held an annual Volunteer Day Saturday April 27th and that Ronnie Moore, Mill Valley Volunteer Coordinator: vmoore@cityofmillvalley.org, was a primary organizer of the event.

⁹ MCCMC Disaster Preparedness: <http://mccmc.org/committees/disasterprep/>

¹⁰ Red Cross Sound the Alarm / Fire Alarm program: <https://www.redcross.org/sound-the-alarm.html>



Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3) Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019

- Ronnie may become the Mill Valley city coordinator for the Marin Business Emergency Readiness (M'BER) Program in that City. Ronnie is also working to develop an Emergency Volunteer Center (EVC) for the City.
 - While County CERT Coordinator Maggie Lang will leave her post in June, she has been asked to continue part time for Mill Valley as an M'BER consultant.
 - Funding to expand M'BER beyond initial efforts remains difficult.
- CERT, Get Ready and Get Ready 5th:
- Maggie was unable to attend this meeting. This part of the agenda is moved to next month. Maggie will retire from her position as CERT Coordinator this June.
- Access + Functional Needs communities (AFN) and MIDC:
- Peter, the Interim chair State Independent Living Council¹¹, reported that he will attend a meeting at the Governor's Office next week. The Council will be recommending systemic changes to improve communication across State Agencies, and to support services needed by persons with Access and Functional Needs (AFN).
- Public Health Preparedness and related programs
- Megan Stevenson, Sr Program Coordinator H&HS Public Health, was unable to attend this meeting. Her portion of the agenda is moved to our next meeting.
- Public Safety / Emergency Management
- Quinn Gardner, SR Emergency Services Manager, was unable to attend this meeting. Her portion of the agenda is moved to our next meeting.
- Utilities including MMWD and PG&E
- Jim Wickham, PG&E Public Safety Specialist, was unable to attend this meeting. Her portion of the agenda is moved to our next meeting.
- Marin Medical Reserve Corps (MMRC), etc.
- Anna Lane, Red Cross, reported on the Central Marin CERT and Neighborhood Response Group exercise held last Saturday. Marin Medical Reserve Corps (MMRC) and about 30 CERTs set up a simulated triage center in a tent, and simulated treatment for about 50 (mostly younger) victims.
 - Dr. Tom Cromwell reported Ann Corta, a nurse with recent experience in San Francisco's Saint Francis Memorial Hospital, is the new Coordinator for the Marin Medical Reserve Corp (MMRC).
 - The MMRC First Aid for Disaster Response (FADR) classes have now trained about 600 persons in Marin.
 - Dr. Cromwell and Shirley Young, RN, recently represented MMRC in conferences held in St. Louis, Mo, and Sacramento.
 - MMRC hopes to recruit new FADR teachers qualified to teach 'Stop the Bleed'¹², a program supported by the American College of Surgeons, as well as chest compression CPR, splinting, emergency carries, and NARCAN first aid.
 - MMRC is speaking with Marin Search and Rescue (SAR)¹³, who already have a robust emergency medical response training, about shared coaching and appearances at events such as the County Fair.
- OES, Training and other Events:

¹¹ California's State Independent Living Council (SILC) is an 18-member council, appointed by the Governor, to represent persons with disabilities throughout the state. See: <https://www.calsilc.ca.gov/>

¹² Stop the Bleed: Bleeding Control Basic and Instructor Course: <https://www.facs.org/clincon2018/events/stop-the-bleed>

¹³ Marin County Sheriff's Search and Rescue (SAR): <http://marinsar.org/>



Public Disaster Education and Preparedness (PDE+P) Committee of the Marin Operational Area Disaster & Citizens Corps Council (DC3) Committee Meeting – May 6, 2019

- A mandatory training for EOC staff to better serve persons with Access and Functional Needs (AFN) is set May 14, 2019. Additional dates for the training are scheduled.¹⁴
- Frank has heard that (DSW) training program is making progress.
- The County Disaster Preparedness Coordinator position is now open. Application and information is available online¹⁵.

V. Open Time / Public Comment

3:00 PM end of meeting

- Catherine closed the meeting.

Next Meetings:

Dates may be flexible as circumstances require.

PDEP Meetings: Year 2019: June 3, July 1, Aug 5, Sept. 9, Oct. 7, Nov. 4, Dec. 2, 2019

Site: PDEP unless otherwise posted: Central Marin Police Community Rm.

DC3 Meetings: 3-5pm: Board Chambers, Civic Center, Dates may be flexible

Year 2019: 3/14/2019, 6/13/2019, 9/12/2019, 12/12/2019

Online: <https://www.marinsheriff.org/about-us/field-service-bureau/office-of-emergency-services>

PDEP_Minutes 2019-05-06 A.docx

Approved at PDEP meeting of 6/3/219

Rev 6-03-2018 1700 hr fcox

¹⁴ The County Access and Functional Needs Coordinator Ms. Laney Morgado is the instructor. Email: lmorgado@marincounty.org

¹⁵ The Marin County Disaster Preparedness Coordinator position will be housed at Ross Valley Fire: <https://www.rossvalleyfire.org/attachments/article/132/Brochure%20RVFD%20disaster%20coordinator.final.4.25.19-1.pdf>